arXiv:1102.0765v1 [math.NT] 3 Feb 2011

A proof of a simple conjecture about harmonic numbers

Jacopo D'Aurizio
elianto84@gmail.com

02-02-2011

Let H_n be the n-th harmonic number:

$$H_n = \sum_{i=1}^{n} \frac{1}{i}.$$

In this paper we will prove that:

Theorem 1. *For every prime number $p \geq 5$, the set*

$$M_p = \{n \in \mathbb{N} : \ p \mid H_n\}$$

is finite.

This fact was conjectured before by Eswarathasan, Levine ([1]) and Boyd ([2]).

We first prove a well-known fact:

Theorem 2 (Wolstenholme)**.** *For every prime $p \geq 5$,*

$$p^2 \mid H_{p-1}.$$

Proof.

$$H_{p-1} = p \cdot \sum_{i=1}^{\frac{p-1}{2}} \frac{1}{i(p-i)}.$$

By Wilson's theorem, $(p-1)! \equiv -1 \pmod{p}$, so the numerator of the rightmost sum is

$$\sum_{i=1}^{\frac{p-1}{2}} i^{-2} \pmod{p}.$$

The squares of the integers from 1 to $\frac{p-1}{2}$ represent every quadratic residue $\pmod{p}$.

Moreover, the quadratic residues are a subgroup of $\mathbb{Z}/_{p\mathbb{Z}}{}^*$, so:

$$\sum_{i=1}^{\frac{p-1}{2}} i^{-2} \equiv \sum_{i=1}^{\frac{p-1}{2}} i^2 \equiv \frac{p(p^2-1)}{24} \equiv 0 \pmod{p}.$$

□

Lemma 1 (Levine)**.** *For every prime $p \geq 5$,*

$$p \mid H_{p^2-p}.$$

Proof. We have:

$$H_{p^2-p} = \sum_{j=1}^{p-1} \left(\frac{1}{jp} + \sum_{i=1+(j-1)p}^{p-1+(j-1)p} \frac{1}{i} \right),$$

where the innermost sum is divisible by p as a consequence of Wolstenholme's theorem. We only need to prove that:

$$p \mid \sum_{j=1}^{p-1} \frac{1}{jp},$$

that is granted to hold by Wolstenholme's theorem, too. □

From now on, let p be a prime greater than 3.

Lemma 2. *If a, b, c are three distinct elements of M_p, with $a < b$ and $(c-b) \equiv 0 \pmod{p}$, then*

$$(c - b + a) \in M_p.$$

Proof. From $p \mid H_a$ and $p \mid H_b$ we have that:

$$p \mid \sum_{i=a+1}^{b} \frac{1}{i},$$

so, for every integer k,

$$p \mid \sum_{i=a+1+kp}^{b+kp} \frac{1}{i}.$$

If $(b + kp) \in M_p$, by taking differences we have that:

$$p \mid H_{a+kp}.$$

□

Let us suppose, now, that M_p is infinite. Then at least one residue classes in $M_p/_{(p^2-p)}$ is infinite: let a_p be the smallest positive integer in such a classes. $(p^2 - p)$ belongs to M_p, so, by Lemma 2, we have that

$$a_p + (p^2 - p)\mathbb{N} \subseteq M_p$$

holds, and by applying Lemma 2 again,

$$(p^2 - p)\mathbb{N} \subseteq M_p.$$

However,

Lemma 3.

$$p \nmid H_{2p^2-2p}.$$

Proof. We have:

$$H_{2p^2-2p} = \sum_{j=1}^{2p-2} \left(\frac{1}{jp} + \sum_{i=1+(j-1)p}^{p-1+(j-1)p} \frac{1}{i} \right),$$

where the innermost sum is divisible by p by Wolstenholme's theorem. So, if $p \mid H_{2p^2-2p}$, then $p \mid H_{2p-2}$. Now:

$$H_{2p-2} = H_{p-1} + \frac{1}{p} + \sum_{i=p+1}^{2p-1} \frac{1}{i} - \frac{1}{2p-1},$$

so, if $p|H_{2p-2}$, then:

$$p \mid \frac{(p-1)}{p(2p-1)},$$

that is clearly impossible since the numerator of the RHS is too small. □

Having reached a contradiction, we have proved Theorem 1.

References

[1] A. Eswarathasan and E. Levine, *p-integral harmonic sums*,
Discrete Math, 1991, volume 91, pp.249–257

[2] David W. Boyd, *A p-adic Study of the Partial Sums of the Harmonic Series*,
Experimental Math, 1994, volume 3, pp.287–302.